

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov

First District, San Francisco

BILL LEONARD Second District, Ontario/Sacramento

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

> JUDY CHU, Ph.D. Fourth District, Los Angeles

> > JOHN CHIANG

State Controller

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING 450 N Street, Room 121, Sacramento December 16-17, 2008

PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTION

RAMON J. HIRSIG **Executive Director**

Tuesday, December 16, 2008

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the December 16-17, 2008 Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board. which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Joann Richmond at (916) 322-1931 or e-mail: Joann.Richmond@boe.ca.gov. Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

Board Committee Meetings - Please see Page 25, O. Adoption of Board Committee Reports and Approval of Committee Actions, for voting results.

Board Meeting

Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Hearings A. There are no items for this matter.

В. **Corporate Franchise and Personal Income Tax Hearings**

B1. Home Depot U.S.A., Inc., 298683

2 11 7101110 2 0001 01011 111 111011 200000		
DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayers' appeal granted.	Dr. Chu	No
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

B2. James F. Brown and Lynnae L. Brown, 423373

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayers' appeal denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

B3. Byron S. Georgiou, 435061 - Appearance Waived

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayers' appeal denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Not participating

B4. Shalimar Lea Beach, 421276

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayers' appeal denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

B5. Christine A. Baker, 441209

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayers' appeal denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

B6. Michael L. Cate, 441278

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayers' appeal denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
A \$750.00 frivolous appeal penalty	Mr. Leonard	Yes
was ordered.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

These items are scheduled for Wednesday, December 17, 2008.

D. Special Taxes Appeals Hearings

This item is scheduled for Wednesday, December 17, 2008.

E. Property Tax Appeals Hearings

Petition for Reassessment of Unitary Value

E1. Sprint PCS (2720), 457703 – "CF"

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's appeal partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

F. Public Hearings

These items are scheduled for Wednesday, December 17, 2008.

G. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters – Consent

G1. Legal Appeals Matters

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
No final determination on	Mr. Leonard	Yes
sub-item 6.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Petitions for Rehearing

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING

- 1. Sierra Textile Company, LP, 301401 (EH)
- 2. Robere's Jewelry, Inc., 220461 (FH)
- Hearing Notice Sent No Response
 - 3. Joginder Lal, 340507 (KH)
 - 4. Carl Joseph Kennedy III, 349941 (KH)
 - 5a. Michael D. Sanders, 295375 (KH)
 - 5b. Sally A. Sanders, 295376 (KH)
 - 6. Cindy A. Saito, 339713 (KH)
- Hearing Notice Sent Appearance Waived
 - 7. The Kordahl Trust Dated 02/22/92, 359922 (UT)
 - 8. Touch 99 Corporation, 301273, (BH)

G2. Franchise and Income Tax Matters

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
No final determination on	Mr. Leonard	Yes
sub-item 11.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Decisions

- 1. Jose R. Angeles, 400667
- 2. Jeanine M. Artmont, 406115
- Marco A. Cerda, 358728
- 4. Drew E. Collins and Linda G. Collins, 406111
- Patricia C. Fleming, 401328
- 6. Manley A. Golson, 437522
- 7. James Griffen and Patricia Griffen, 379667
- 8. Roger A. Grubic and Janice F. Grubic, 380418
- Jack D. Lawrence, Jr., 404660
- 10. K. Linda Lawrence, 401347
- 11. Personal Selling Power, Inc., 380557
- 12. Roger O. Schafer and Frances F. Schafer, 398947
- 13. Laura J. Tennison, 402863
- Petitions for Rehearing
 - 14. Carlos M. Alcala and Norma Alcala, 259159
 - 15. William Amonette Anderson, 397348
 - Greg Galaski, 383410
 - 17. Bryon Hoffman, 381469
 - 18. Shawn Mills, 402021
- Hearing Notice Sent No Response
 - 19. Charles H. Bond, 421271
 - 20. Thao Nguyen and Phucy Nguyen, 360304
 - 21. John H. Vories, 389158
 - 22. Gregg Shanberg, 402904

- Hearing Notice Sent Appearance Waived
 - 23. Alexander Kazerani, 342393
 - 24. David L. Lee and Ellen W. Lee, 345434

G3. Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Matters

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Decisions

- 1. Charlotte Agcaoili, 400309
- 2. Gloria Anderson, 431962
- 3. Odette Baladi (Deceased), 389577
- 4. Jeanne Cervantes, 431542
- 5. Francisco M. Curiel, 422996
- 6. Charles Warren Esler, 380523
- 7. Kadedra Monique Fowler, 397208
- 8. Roy A. Harrington, 400305
- 9. Michael S. Jewett, 422819
- 10. Shonna Krogh, 386513
- 11. Marie Patton, 382020
- 12. Hubert O. Ross, 401187
- 13. James Royer Segovia, 394603

G4. Sales and Use Taxes Matters

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes – except not participating in sub-items 14 and 18.

Redeterminations

- 1. Los Angeles Department of Water and Power, 354588 (AA)
- 2. The Merchant of Tennis, Inc., 293594 (AS)
- 3. Aixtron, Inc., 342572 (GH)
- 4. Fry's Electronics, Inc., 361957 (GH)
- 5. Gulfstream Aerospace Corporation, 332200 (OH)
- 6. Los Angeles Department of Water and Power, 353893 (AA)

- 7. Masimo Corporation, 378525 (EA)
- 8. Gateway 2000 Major Accounts, Inc., 333468 (OH)
- 9. OCB, LLC, 423343 (EA)
- 10. Henry E. Solowiej, 379793 (EA)
- Relief of Penalty/Interest
 - 11. Stock Building Supply West, Inc., 465210 (OH)
 - 12. Raley's, 465314 (JH)
 - 13. S. B. Restaurant Co., 464385 (AA)
- Denials of Claims for Refund
 - 14. Wells Fargo Bank, 424234 (BH)
 - 15. Diageo North America, Inc., 356849 (OH)
 - 16. Thiel Structural Steel, Inc., 318432 (KH)
 - 17. San Gabriel Insulation, Inc., 402679 (AP)
 - 18. Best Buy Store, LP, 436923 (OH)
 - 19. Capital One Auto Finance, Inc., 296983 (OH)

G5. Sales and Use Taxes Matters – Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
No final determination on	Mr. Leonard	Yes
sub-item 27.	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes – except not participating in sub-items 11 and 21.

- 1. PC Mall Sales, Inc., 405670 (AS)
- 2. Aixtron, Inc., 465799 (GH)
- 3. Aptix Corporation, 293456 (GH)
- 4. Evans Communications, 465351 (KH)
- 5. DSW Shoe Warehouse, Inc., 465507 (OH)
- 6. Rajmp, Inc., 463856 (FH)
- 7. Lexington Acquisition, Inc., 435022 (AC)
- 8. Bonnie Lee Kehoe, 465496 (KH)
- Refunds
 - 9. Ascent Media Creative Services, Inc., 464413 (BH)
 - 10. Sourcecorp BPS Southern California, Inc., 331812 (OH)
 - 11. Arco Material Supply Company, 440264 (AS)
 - 12. Chevron U.S.A., Inc., 464364 (BH)
 - 13. PC Mall Sales, Inc., 465205 (AS)
 - 14. Palm Springs Motor, Inc., 433713 (EH)
 - 15. Acushnet Company, 424506 (OH)
 - 16. North Island Financial Credit Union, 417198 (FH)
 - 17. National Semiconductor Corporation, 317036 (GH)
 - 18. Intevac, Inc., 437742 (GH)
 - 19. Maxtor Corporation, 462979 (GH)
 - 20. The Golden 1 Credit Union, 460242 (KH)
 - 21. Exxon Mobil Corporation, 234706 (OH)

- 22. Bloomberg, LP, 388172 (OH)
- 23. Color Control, Inc., 360146 (OH)
- 24. Opex Corporation, 465613 (OH)
- 25. Zenith Insurance Company, 351533 (AC)
- 26. Chevron Credit Bank, National Association, 447146 (CH)
- 27. UPS Oasis Supply Corporation, 340492 (OH)
- 28. Covad Communications Company, 390374 (GH)
- 29. Banana Republic (California), LLC, 351407 (BH)
- 30. Old Navy (California), LLC, 351348 (BH)
- 31. Taylor Made Golf Company, Inc., 462276 (FH)
- 32. Village Nurseries Wholesale, LLC, 464334 (EA)
- 33. Cardinal Health 415, Inc., 266959 (AC)
- 34. Frank Kofsuske, 272134 (BH)
- 35. Hold Everything, Inc., 465637 (BH)
- 36. World Wide Parts & Accessories Corp., 420190 (CH)
- 37. Wescom Credit Union, 460973 (AP)
- 38. Philips Semiconductors, Inc., 465636 (GH)
- 39. SCE Federal Credit Union, 349664 (AP)
- 40. Comprehensive Diagnostic Imaging, 263731 (AC)
- 41. Capital One Auto Finance, Inc., 296983 (OH)
- 42. A-L Financial Corp., 460248 (EA)
- 43. K.D.M. Enterprises, 426881 (EH)
- 44. Wesco Tool & Equipment Rental, LLC, 394307 (AS)
- 45. Dentsply Prosthetics U. S., LLC 417199 (OH)
- 46. Kern Schools Federal Credit Union, 451301 (AR)
- 47. Chevron Credit Bank, National Association, 447147 (CH)

G6. Special Taxes Matters

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes – except not participating in sub-item 3.
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

- Relief of Penalty
 - Life Insurance Company of North America, 463960 (ET) 'CF'
 - 2. Endurance Reinsurance Corporation of America, 465642 (ET) 'CF'
- > Denials of Claim for Refund
 - 3. Conocophillips Company, 441890 (MT)

G7. Special Taxes Matters – Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

Refunds

- 1. Chevron USA, Inc., 464117 (MT)
- 2. CM Life Insurance Company, 457463 (ET) 'CF'
- 3. Tower Insurance Company of New York, 461948 (ET) 'CF'

G8. Property Tax Matters

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

- Petitions for Reassessment of Private Railroad Car Tax
 - 1. INEOS Olefins & Polymers USA, LLC (5711), 465161 'CF'
 - 2. Trinity Industries Leasing Company (5758), 465160 'CF'
 - 3. Azteca Milling, LP (5754), 465150 'CF'
 - 4. BP Corporation North America, Inc. (540), 465350 'CF'
 - 5. Conagra Foods (MHC, Inc.) (5761), 465348 'CF'
- Timber Tax Yield Tax Claim for Refund
 - 6. Maribeth W. Collins, et al., #2, 468222

There are no items for these matters:

G9. Cigarette License Fee Matters

G10.Legal Appeals Property Tax Matters

H. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters – Adjudicatory

H1. Legal Appeals Matters

Cases Heard But Not Decided

1a. Trung Duc Trinh and Shelly C. Yun-Trinh, 330253 (AS)

1b. Shaya Beverly Center, Inc., 330254 (AS)

-		
<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayers petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

2. Ibrahim D. Ibrahim and Sahar Ibrahim, 310288 (EH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

3. Danny Kangsok Kim, 386898 (EA)

4. Cities of Los Angeles and San Jose, 352192

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Petitioner's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Local Tax Reallocation Hearings

Cities of Torrance and Los Angeles, 469251

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Petitioner's request for rehearing	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

6. Cities of South San Francisco and Los Angeles, 469250

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Petitioner's request for rehearing	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

7. County of Los Angeles, 469243

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Petitioner's request for rehearing	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

8. Cities of Pomona and Los Gatos, 469261

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Petitioner's request for rehearing	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

9. City of Compton, 469256

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Petitioner's request for rehearing	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

10. City of Union City, 469296

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Petitioner's request for rehearing	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

H2. Franchise and Income Tax Matters

Decisions

1. John P. Fields and N. Carol Fields, 361390

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

2. Pete Hernandez, 378089

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Petitions for Rehearing

3. Kenneth Banks, 327922

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

4. John Cirino and Sepideh Cirino, 361476

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
No final determination.	Dr. Chu	
	Mr. Leonard	
	Ms. Steel	
	Ms. Yee	
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	

5. Swift Transportation Company, Inc., and Swift Transportation Corporation, 266318

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition granted.	Dr. Chu	No
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	No
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

H3. Homeowner and Renter Property Tax Assistance Matters

Decision

1. Allan Walden, 383500

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

H4. Sales and Use Taxes Matters
There are no items for this matter.

H5. Sales and Use Taxes Matters - Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds

Credits and Cancellations

1. Infinity Material Management Solutions, 379564 (GH)

	1	1
<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition approved.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

> Refunds

2. Gottschalks, Inc., 441170 (KH)

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

3. The Mercury Trust, 374580 (UT)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition approved.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

There are no items for the following matters:

- H6. Special Taxes Matters
- H7. Special Taxes Matters Credits, Cancellations, and Refunds
- H8. Property Tax Matters
- H9. Cigarette License Fee Matters

H10. Legal Appeals Property Tax Matters

> Petitions for Reassessment of Unitary Value

1. Golden State Water Company (101), 457748 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

2. San Diego Gas & Electric Company (0141), 458198 'CF'

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

3. Verizon California, Inc. (201), 458200 'CF'

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

4. Pacific Bell Telephone Company (279), 451533 'CF'

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

5. Dynegy Moss Landing, LLC (1103), 458195 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

6. La Paloma Generating Company, LLC (1112) 457485 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

7. Reliant Energy Mandalay, LLC (1114), 457861 'CF'

		ACCOUNT OF THE PROPERTY OF THE
<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

8. Reliant Energy Ormond Beach, LLC (1115) 457862 'CF'

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

9. Reliant Energy Etiwanda, LLC (1116), 457863 'CF'

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

10. Mountainview Power Company, LLC (1119), 458202 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

11. GWF Energy, LLC – Hanford (1122), 457976 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

12. GWF Energy, LLC - Henrietta (1123), 457990 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

13. GWF Energy, LLC - Tracy (1124), 457997 'CF'

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

14. Elk Hills Power, LLC (1126), 457487 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Not participating
	Ms. Steel	Not participating
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

15. Delta Energy Center, LLC (1128), 457473 'CF'

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

16. Pastoria Energy Facility, LLC (1131), 457475 'CF'

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

17. Calpine Construction Finance Company, LP (1132), 457477 'CF'

· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·			40000	<i>,</i> .
DECISION		MEMBER		BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denie	ed.	Dr. Chu	Yes	
		Mr. Leonard	No	
		Ms. Steel	No	
		Ms. Yee	Yes	
		Mr. Chiang	Yes	

18. Metcalf Energy Center, LLC (1133), 457478 'CF'

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

19. Qwest Communications Corporation (2463), 458009 'CF'

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

20. AT&T Mobility, LLC (2606), 451532 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

21. Level 3 Communications, LLC (7761), 458194 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

22. Pacific Pipeline System, LLC (486), 458193 'CF

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition partially	Dr. Chu	Yes
granted/denied.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Not participating
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

Petition for Penalty Abatement Unitary

23. EAS Communication, Inc. (7859), 450872 'CF'

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

24. Intelsat Global Service Corporation (7969), 458199 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

25. Legent Communications Corporation (7978), 450873 'CF'

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

26. Utility Telephone, Inc. (7994), 450047 'CF'

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	No
	Ms. Steel	No
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

I. Tax Program Nonappearance Matters

I1. Property Taxes Matters

- Unitary Land Escaped Assessments
 - 1.a. Sprint PCS (2720) 'CF'
 - 1.b. Cricket Communications, Inc. (2762) 'CF'

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang	Yes

Board Roll Changes

2. 2006, 2007 and 2008 Board Rolls of State-Assessed Property

- 0	,		, ,
	<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
	Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
		Mr. Leonard	Yes
		Ms. Steel	Yes
		Ms. Yee	Yes
		Mr. Chiang	Yes

12. Offers-in-Compromise Recommendations

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

1. Herman Mendel

Chief Counsel Matters

J. Rulemaking

These items are scheduled for Wednesday, December 17, 2008.

There are no items for the following items:

- K. Business Taxes
- L. Property Taxes
- M. Other Chief Counsel Matters

These items are scheduled for Wednesday, December 17, 2008.

Administrative Session

The following items are scheduled for Wednesday, December 17, 2008.

- N. Consent Agenda
- O. Adoption of Board Committee Reports and Approval of Committee Actions
- P. Other Administrative Matters

Q. Closed Session

These items are scheduled for Wednesday, December 17, 2008.



STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION

450 N STREET, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA PO BOX 942879, SACRAMENTO, CALIFORNIA 94279-0080 (916) 322-2270 • FAX (916) 324-3984 www.boe.ca.gov BETTY T. YEE First District, San Francisco

BILL LEONARD Second District, Ontario/Sacramento

MICHELLE STEEL Third District, Rolling Hills Estates

JUDY CHU, Ph.D.

JOHN CHIANG State Controller

Fourth District, Los Angeles

RAMON J. HIRSIG Executive Director

STATE BOARD OF EQUALIZATION MEETING 450 N Street, Room 121, Sacramento December 16-17, 2008

PRELIMINARY RECORD OF BOARD ACTION

Wednesday, December 17, 2008

The following is a preliminary record of Board actions taken at the December 16-17, 2008 Board Meeting. This is not an official record and is subject to correction or modification. The official record of the Board's actions is the minutes of the Board, which will be adopted at a subsequent meeting.

The Board's decision reflects only the issues resolved by the Board at the meeting. Issues resolved prior to the meeting are not reflected in this document.

If you would like specific information regarding items on this Preliminary Record of Board Action, please telephone Joann Richmond at (916) 322-1931 or e-mail: Joann.Richmond@boe.ca.gov. Please be advised that material containing confidential taxpayer information cannot be publicly disclosed.

C. Sales and Use Tax Appeals Hearings

C1. ABC-NACO, Inc., 167411 (OH)

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination.	Dr. Chu	Yes
The Board ordered that the petition	Mr. Leonard	Yes
be submitted for decision, granting	Ms. Steel	Yes
the petitioner 30 days to file	Ms. Yee	Yes
supporting documents, the Department 30 days to respond, and the Appeals Division 30 days thereafter to review the petitioner's supporting documents, the Department's response and provide its recommendation to the Board.	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C2. R. Nuri Otus, 308720 (BH)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

C3. R.C.P. Block & Brick, Inc., 283573, 283514 (FH)

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Taxpayer's petition/claim denied.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

D. Special Taxes Appeals Hearing

D1. Fassel M. Elder and Amal Elder, 272656 (MT)

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
No final Board determination.	Dr. Chu	
Postponed to the January 21-22,	Mr. Leonard	
2009 Board Meeting.	Ms. Steel	
	Ms. Yee	
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	

Public Hearings

F1. Timber Yield Tax Rate

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

F2. Timber Harvest Values

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

F3. Proposed Amendments to Sales and Use Tax Regulations 1506, Miscellaneous Services Enterprises and 1524, Manufacturers of Personal Property

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

F4. Proposed Amendments to Sales and Use Tax Regulation 1705, Relief from Liability

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Chief Counsel Matters

Rulemaking

J1. Petition to Adopt a Regulation to Designate Qualified Veteran Itinerant Vendors as Consumers of Tangible Personal Property

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
No final determination.	Dr. Chu	Yes
The board directed staff to submit	Mr. Leonard	No
a request for an opinion from the	Ms. Steel	Yes
Attorney General and report	Ms. Yee	Yes
response to the Board.	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

J2. Proposed Amendment to Conflict of Interest Code, Regulation 6001, General Provisions

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

J3. Proposed Amendments to Sales and Use Tax Regulation 1620, Interstate and Foreign Commerce

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

J4. Proposed Amendments to Sales and Use Tax Regulation 1502, Computers, Programs, and Data Processing

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
DECISION	WEWDER	BOARD VOIL
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

M. Other Chief Counsel Matters

M1. Proposed Amendments to the Rules of Order

The state of the s		
DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

M2. Retired Annuitant – Hiring Delegation

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Administrative Session

N. Consent Agenda

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved staff recommendations.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

- N1. Approval of Board Employee Retirement Resolutions
 - Gary L. Evans
 - Wolfgang Liebelt
 - Hue T. Nguyen
 - Robert Wils
- N2. Approval of Board Meeting Minutes
 - October 28-29, 2008
- N3. Approval of Proposed Revisions to Compliance Policy and Procedures Manual Chapter 4, Security
- N4. Approval of Adjustment of Sales Tax Prepayment Rate on Motor Vehicle Fuel, Diesel Fuel and Jet Fuel

O. Adoption of Board Committee Reports and Approval of Committee Actions

O1. Legislative Committee

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Adopted committee report and	Dr. Chu	Yes
approved the actions therein.	Mr. Leonard	Yes
For details see:	Ms. Steel	Yes
http://www.boe.ca.gov/legdiv/legm	Ms. Yee	Yes
eetings08.htm	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

I. 2009 Legislative Proposals Property Taxes

- 1-1 Add section 62.3 to the Revenue and Taxation Code to provide an exclusion from a change in ownership when two individuals own a principal residence together (as joint tenants or tenants in common) and the property transfers from one cotenant to the other upon the death of the transferor cotenant with the survivor cotenant obtaining sole ownership of the property.
- 1-2 Amend Revenue and Taxation Code section 276, related to the Disabled Veterans' Exemption, to delete obsolete references to prior exemption amounts that have since been increased, and to correct a transposition error within that section that intends a cross reference to section 4985. (Housekeeping)

<u>POSITION</u>	MEMBER	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

1-3 Amend Revenue and Taxation Code section 441 to eliminate a requirement that owners of noncommercial boats with an initial cost of more than \$100,000 file a property statement every year.

POSITION	<u>MEMBER</u>	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

1-4 Amend Government Code section 15641 to clarify that a cross reference to "section 408" refers to that section of code in the Revenue and Taxation Code rather than the Government Code. (Technical)

<u>POSITION</u>	MEMBER	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

1-5 Amend Revenue and Taxation Code sections 480.3 and 480.4 to remove the specific detail of the Preliminary Change in Ownership Report from statute and instead authorize the Board to prescribe the form after consultation with the California Assessors' Association and interested parties.

<u>POSITION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

- 1-6 Amend Government Code section 15606.5 and Revenue and Taxation Code sections 670 and 671 to expressly allow the Board to deliver online continuing education training to certificated property tax appraisers through established web-based systems maintained by community colleges that charge fees for online courses.
- 1-7 Amend Revenue and Taxation Code sections 69 and 69.3 to treat land and improvements as separate units in meeting the "substantially damaged or destroyed" threshold of 50% for purposes of qualifying for disaster relief via a base year value transfer.

<u>POSITION</u>	MEMBER	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

1-8 Amend Revenue and Taxation Code section 214.6 to clarify the filing procedures for obtaining a property tax exemption on property owned by a church or a nonprofit organization that is leased to a public school, community college, state college, or state university, including the University of California.

POSITION	MEMBER	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Business Taxes

2-1 Add sections 6591.6, 7655.5, 8876.5, 12631.5, 30281.5, 32252.5, 40101.5, 41095.5, 43155.5, 45153.5, 46154.5, 50112.6, 55042.5, and 60207.5 to the Revenue and Taxation Code to impose interest on a daily basis in cases where the Board, itself, meeting as a public body finds, taking into account all facts and circumstances, that it would be inequitable to impose an entire month's interest on a prepayment or payment made one day late, under specified circumstances.

<u>POSITION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

Business Taxes – Sales and Use Taxes

3-5 Add Revenue and Taxation Code section 6018.3 to the Sales and Use Tax Law to specify that a United States veteran, as specified, shall be regarded as a consumer, rather than a retailer, of food products and nonalcoholic beverages that he or she sells, provided that, for purposes of selling these items, the veteran has no employees and no permanent place of business, as defined.

<u>POSITION</u>	MEMBER	COMMITTEE VOTE
No final determination.	Dr. Chu	
	Mr. Leonard	
	Ms. Steel	
	Ms. Yee	
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	

3-6 Add section 6363.4 to the Revenue and Taxation Code to provide an exemption from the sales and use tax, sales of tangible personal property by thrift stores operated by specified nonprofit organizations that provide, in partnership with the Navy and Marine Corps, financial, educational, and other assistance to members of the Naval Service of the United States, eligible family members, and survivors when in need.

<u>POSITION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

3-7 Amend Revenue and Taxation Code sections 6011 and 6012 to eliminate the sales and use tax exclusion for separately stated charges for transportation.

<u>POSITION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	COMMITTEE VOTE
No final determination.	Dr. Chu	
	Mr. Leonard	
	Ms. Steel	
	Ms. Yee	
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	

Administration

5-1 Amend Government Code section 15609 to require the Members of the Board to meet monthly in the state but not exclusively in Sacramento.

<u>POSITION</u>	MEMBER	COMMITTEE VOTE
Approved staff recommendation.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

O2. Customer Services and Administrative Efficiency Committee

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Adopted committee report.	Dr. Chu	Yes
For details see:	Mr. Leonard	Yes
http://www.boe.ca.gov/meetings/cu	Ms. Steel	Yes
stsrv/custsrv08.htm	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

P. Other Administrative Matters

There are no items for the following matters:

- P1. Executive Director's Report
- P2. Chief Counsel Report

P3. Deputy Director's Report

- a. Sales and Use Tax
 - Collection Enhancement Task Force Update+
 Update on activities and accomplishments for the Enhancing
 Collections Task Force including responses to SEIU's May 2008
 report titled SEIU Local 1000 Findings and Recommendations on

report titled SEIU Local 1000 Findings and Recommendations on Methods to Enhance Tax Collections and an updated Task Force Action Plan.

 Issue Paper 08-014, Proposal to Raise the Threshold for Board Member Approval of Refunds in Excess of \$50,000+

<u>DECISION</u>	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
No final determination.	Dr. Chu	
Postponed to the March meeting.	Mr. Leonard	
	Ms. Steel	
	Ms. Yee	
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	

- b. Property and Special Taxes
 There are no items for this matter.
- c. Administration
 - Request for approval of contracts over \$1 Million+
 - a. A contract with International Network Consulting to provide Systems Analysts for the e-services expansion project.+

DECISION	MEMBER	BOARD VOTE
Approved.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

b. A contract with International Network Consulting to provide programmers for the e-services expansion project.+

DECISION	<u>MEMBER</u>	BOARD VOTE
Approved.	Dr. Chu	Yes
	Mr. Leonard	Yes
	Ms. Steel	Yes
	Ms. Yee	Yes
	Mr. Chiang/ Ms. Mandel	Yes

2. Facilities Update

- a. New York Office Relocation
- b. Status of on-going projects at 450 N Street
- c. Building Repair Costs+

A review of the information provided by DGS on the actual costs to date for the building repairs and the estimated costs for the pending projects.

3. Fiscal Update

a. Budget Update 2008/09 +

This update will include highlights of BOE's fiscal year 2008/09.

b. Budget Update 2009/10 +

This update will include the status of BOE's fiscal year 2009/10 Budget Change Proposals.

- c. 2010/11 Budget Preparation Tentative Schedule +
 This update will include an overview of BOE's tentative schedule for the fiscal year 2010/11 budget cycle.
- d. Update on Governor's Special Session for the 2008/09 Budget This update will include information on the Governor's special session proposals that affect the BOE and its employees.

Q. Closed Session